



CITY OF TACOMA SUSTAINABLE TACOMA COMMISSION MEETING NOTES

DATE: December 11, 2012

COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT: Bill Anderson, Ellen Moore, Holly Williams, Carol Shiflett, Nick Cutting, Jane Moore, Karen Hamilton, Kimberlie Lelli, Bliss Moore, Phil Coughlan

COMMISSION MEMBER EXCUSED: Dan Dzyacky

OTHERS PRESENT: Melissa Paulson, Alysén Laasko, Kristi Lynett, Jetta Antonakos, Bill Smith, Lisa Rennie, Catherine Taylor

▪ **Approval of the November 13, 2012 Meeting Notes**

The November 13, 2012 meeting notes were approved and adopted.

▪ **Review of the December Agenda**

The December agenda was reviewed and approved.

▪ **Smoke Reduction Zone Update – Melissa Paulson, PSCAA**

Tacoma-Pierce County (TPC) has a pollution problem with wood smoke from home heating. Our community is one of only 32 areas in the country to violate the federal Clean Air Act for fine particle pollution.

There are 80K wood-burning stoves in the TPC smoke reduction zone; 24K are uncertified devices (stoves built prior to 1994). The main focus is to eliminate all 24K stoves; the goal is to remove *at least* 5K by 2017.

Background

- 2006, EPA lowered the health-based standard from 65 ug/m³ down to 35 ug/m³
- 2012, PSCAA adopts their Clean Air Task Force recommendations, and new rules and programs are being implemented
- 2014, Deadline for meeting EPA's standard
- 2015, Uncertified wood stoves will be illegal within the TPC smoke reduction zone; enforcement is yet to be determined

Wood smoke is determined by way of:

- Three permanent monitors (Tideflats, So. L St, South Hill);
- Mobile and temporary monitoring;
- Equipment that can tease out the chemical fingerprints of pollution and look for chemical hallmarks; and
- Patterns (seasonal/daily)

Two main strategies to the solution

- Enhancing and increasing enforcement of burn bans
- Requiring the removal of old uncertified devices by September 30, 2015

Burn ban enforcement

- Enforcement process is owned by PSCAA
- Two enforcement standards 1) Smoke density (any time of year); and 2) visible emissions (during burn bans only)
- Observation of a potential violation (via photography)
- Notices of violation
- Civil penalty

Changes to enforcement

- Significant increase in patrolling staff - will be going from 8 to 60
- Inter-local agreements with local agencies (patrolling areas and reporting back to PSCAA)
- Nighttime enforcement with digital photography
- Revision of the civil penalty structure
 - Start at \$1K with substantial reductions for first offense
 - Different penalties for low-income households

Wood stove program

- Three components – replacement, removal and low-income
- Goal – removal of 1100 uncertified stoves and inserts
- Eligibility – located within the smoke reduction zone; pre-1995 wood-burning device; income qualification
- Replacement (drawings held 11/30 and 2/22)
 - 10 residents will receive no-cost replacements
 - 250 residents will receive up to \$1500 off cost of a new device (no wood)

Removal (buy-back)

- \$200 for in-home removal
- \$350 for you-haul removal

Low-Income

- Free replacement (allows certified wood)
- \$1M available

Public outreach

- Three primary messages
 - Burn ban enforcement is increasing; avoid possible fines
 - Assistance is available to help residents “leave their old flame behind.”
 - Practice cleaner burning techniques

Public campaign development

- Lead agency, PSCAA; Consultant, BCRA, Inc.
- Multi-year campaign strategy
- Early input from key partners
- Consumer research and analysis
- Adaptive management

Campaign components

- Billboards and TNT advertising
- Website: www.airsafepiercecounty.org
- Printed materials (flyers, posters, fast-fact cards)
- Social media (Twitter, Facebook, YouTube)

■ **Recycling Research Update – Alysen Laasko, Project Staff**

Mandatory recycling is government intervention at the city, county or state level requiring citizens and/or businesses to participate in a recycling program. Some states, like CA, are introducing ordinances this year requiring cities to have commercial recycling. Service requirements are considered a type of mandatory recycling where the trash collectors are mandated to offer recycling to the customers. And Tacoma is researching a user-mandate or an ordinance, in which recyclables could not be mixed with garbage without a fine.

There are four types of waste recycling users: 1) Single household/four-plex residents; 2) apartment complex/multi-household residents; 3) businesses/commercial; and 4) self-haulers at waste and recycling centers. Most cities combine businesses and apartment complexes together.

Tacoma's Waste Management

- Managed by City general government through Environmental Services
- Residents served: 53.6K for waste; 50.9K for recycling
- Commercial businesses served: 4.9K for waste; 2.7K for recycling
- Haulers are employed by the City for garbage and residential recycling. Commercial recyclers can use the City or private companies.
- Cost: \$97.56/ton of trash collected and disposed

Seattle's Recycling Program

Seattle is currently the only city in WA that has a mandatory recycling ban. Seattle's ban specifies that garbage bins cannot be contaminated by more than 10% of recyclable material, and recycling bins cannot be contaminated by more than 10% of garbage material. Seattle's recycling ban is managed by Seattle Public Utilities and was effective January 1, 2005 (enforcement did not begin until 2006).

- Residents served: 283.5K households
- Commercial served: 480.3K businesses
- Trash haulers: two city-contracted companies handle waste
- Budget: \$400K per year – comparable cost prior to the ban
- Method of inspections
 - Trash collectors visually look into each single-family garbage bin. If 10% or more of recyclables are seen, the garbage will not be picked up and a "tag" is left on the can.
 - Apartments and businesses are subject to random surprise inspections
 - 3K apartments and 2K businesses are inspected annually (after two "tags" a \$50 fine is attached to the utility bill)
 - Self-haulers are subject to random inspections
- Recycling rate goal for 2012 is 60% (2011 rate was 55.4%)
- Current budget is 0% for education/outreach; what they do spend is for new customers and program expansion re: putting food scraps into yard waste.
- Violations and fines – out of 600K households, only 500 cans are not collected each month (repeat offenders are not tracked)
- Ten businesses are issued warnings each year (to-date, no businesses have received fines).

Next steps for Seattle

- Redesign of their transfer stations
- Research ways to further decrease violation rates
- Looking at passing a food scrap ban (food scraps in yard waste only)

Portland Recycling Program

- Managed by the Bureau of Planning and Sustainability and Metro regional government
- Trash haulers: private-run companies compete for business
- Residential service: franchise system, city contracts out to one hauler for a particular area of the city and the city sets the rates; haulers are mandated to offer recycling. Portland does not have a user-ordinance, but indicate they have 90% participation
- Commercial: free market, competitive system; businesses must recycle 75% of their waste (glass, paper containers, yard waste, construction debris).
 - Enforcement – once notice is given, customers have 30-days to comply, with up to \$600 in fines for non-compliance
- In 2008, Portland updated their commercial mandatory recycling law, as recycling rates had plateaued at 55%

Next steps for project staff

- Research other cities with mandatory recycling laws - Sacramento, Cleveland, etc.
- Contact WA State Recycling Association for information on WA-specific recycling
- Research how other WA cities manage waste – Bellevue, Everett, Federal Way, Olympia, etc.
- Contact Portland to research the effects of their new mandatory recycling law

▪ **Staff Updates**

- Sustainability Expo planning meeting - January 3rd, 3:30 pm, TMB #248. Expo suggestions:
 - Set-up Tacoma farmer's market in the lobby
 - Implement the City's new arts EnviroChallenger program (grades K-5)
 - Kid's activities corner
 - Workshops
 - Goal to increase turnout by 10%

The expo is March 2nd at the convention center; members will volunteer to staff a booth

- The Wapato project continues to go well. A private company will be offering up to 70 free garbage disposals in the neighborhood. Residents in the Wapato neighborhood, that choose not to use their yard waste bins, will volunteer to assist staff in a study on how well the disposals work for managing food waste.
- Puget Sound coal train hearing in Seattle, December 13
- In January, two UW Evan's School students will begin working on the CAP update and climate adaptation assessment. A major component of this will be focusing on the STCs workplan.
- Pt. Defiance Zoo is interested in working with the STC to promote business awards for those businesses who have demonstrated ghg reduction; members will assist in evaluating those proposals/applications in the spring.
- Green event suggestions – staff are looking at working with organizations that receive City permits or funds for their event, and incorporating suggestions for “greening-up” their event into their City contracts. The first event would be First Night. Over the next few months, staff will be working with various event organizers (one-on-one consultations).

▪ **Public Comment**

There was no public comment.

▪ **Adjournment**

The meeting adjourned at 5:30 pm

The next meeting of the Sustainable Tacoma Commission will be Tuesday, January 8, 2013, 3:30 to 5:30 pm, Tacoma Municipal Building North, 733 Market Street, Room 16.