

Tacoma Community Workforce Advisory Committee

DRAFT Ballot on Proposed Mechanisms to Promote City Public Works Hiring Goals

v. 2.25.19

To be converted to a spreadsheet that can be automatically tallied when committee members send it in. We will discuss the spreadsheet at Meeting 5, make adjustments, and send it out to committee members for completion at the end of the week. Responses will be due Friday, March 8 (proposed).

Concepts on the ballot are drawn from Advisory Committee member comments and homework, staff identified solutions presented on the homework document, as well as recommendations in the Griffin & Strong WMBE Disparity Study. Ballot to be reviewed with group at Meeting 5; members can submit additional ideas by 3/1. (there are 66 ideas on the ballot—many of them are similar, and we will talk at Meeting 5 about what ideas can be consolidated)

Instructions: For each concept, please provide a rating between 1 and 5. You can rate everything a “1” or a “5” or anything in between—this is not a forced ranking exercise; it is about gauging your level of support for these ideas. If you don’t know how to rate the item, leave the rating column blank and instead insert a “1” in the “Don’t Know” column.

- Ratings:**
- 1 – Strongly Oppose**
 - 2 – Oppose**
 - 3—Neutral**
 - 4—Support**
 - 5—Strongly Support**

Ratings will be summed and averaged by the number of respondents (excluding “don’t know” responses).

The Committee will review and discuss the results at Meeting 6; the results will be used to help identify recommendations to forward for Council’s consideration (in addition to comments/recommendations on the CWA document.)

#	Concept	My rating of this concept (1-5)	Don’t know (insert a 1 here)
	Sample issue 1: Meeting SBE 5% utilization goals not well linked bidder ratings		
1.a	Make no change to current City bid protocols around SBE utilization requirements		
1.b	Create a City funded program that subsidizes SBE wages and on-the job training costs for these firms --- money would be given to contractors to offset their additional costs (subject to confirmation of hiring the SBEs)		
1.c	Increase the value to the bidder of meeting the target		

#	Concept	My rating of this concept (1-5)	Don't know (insert a 1 here)
1.d	Adjust code to ensure bidders considered responsive only if they clearly will meet the goal.		
1.e	Reduce the 5% incentive to better meet the reality of the cost of SBE bids to prime contractors		
1.f			
	Sample issue 2: Insufficient number of incoming apprentices to the workforce		
2.a	Increase pre-apprenticeship training opportunities in City in partnership with local institutions		
2.b	Contract with unions to provide apprentice training to residents of distressed areas		
2.c	Contract with agencies other than unions to provide apprentice training to residents of distressed areas		
2.d	Only Tacoma residents should qualify for assistance/credit under the LEAP program¹		
2.e	Eliminate LEAP and create new oversight committee focused on apprentice recruitment and training		
2.f	Evaluate challenges/capacity of LEAP program and address those challenges, increase capacity		
2.g	Increase apprentice retention funding/support in City of Tacoma		
2.h	City should take no additional actions		
2.i	Promote apprenticeship programs that target both underemployed and unemployed people—use weekend and evening training sessions		
2.j	Promote awareness of existing apprenticeship programs		
2.k	City should seek Union action to make union apprenticeship programs more accessible to low-income persons and persons of color and women		
2.l	Fund support for needs of apprentices other than training—child care, transportation, etc.		
2.m	Provide information to individuals considering new employment about the impact of it may have on their other government benefits		
2.n	Use Workforce Central as the City's workforce department – rather than setting something up inside City government		
2.o	Include Workforce Development Council in City workforce planning efforts		

¹ Struck through items are have a significant question as to legality.

#	Concept	My rating of this concept (1-5)	Don't know (insert a 1 here)
2.p	Include workforce development system as a partner in workforce strategies		
	Sample issue 3: Insufficient WMBE Utilization on City Funded Projects		
3.a	Increase funding for the City's contract compliance department so they can oversee contractor compliance with WMBE goals and other recommendations of the diversity study (Diversity Study Recommendation (DS))		
3.b	Provide more advance notice of upcoming public works opportunities to increase ability of smaller firms to prepare and bid (DS)		
3.c	Fund supportive service programs for WMBE firms—how to get certified, complete bid forms, etc. (DS)		
3.d	Institute a small business reserve program for projects that can only be bid on by small businesses. (DS)		
3.e	Include national procurement coding in procurements to synchronize contracting across city departments, increase ability for small firms to determine if the work is something for which they are qualified.(DS)		
3.f	Collect award and paid subcontractor data on all public works contracts—including information on the minority and minority subcontractors. (DS)		
3.g	Regularly update the WMBE list and ensure that it mirrors the list of state certified WSMBEs. (DS)		
3.h	Investigate possible discrimination where bidders on large projects submit little to no proposed WMBE utilization—bidders should be required to list firms they contacted, bids received from subcontractors, as well as who was selected.(DS)		
3.i	Where the city is providing benefits to private sector projects (Land, tax incentives, infrastructure, or other items of value), the City should extend WMBE participation requirements. (DS)		
3.j	Establish race and gender-based subcontracting goals that are aspirational, as well as project goals, compliant with I-200, based on availability of WMBE firms in the local market. Update goals annually based on data on available WMBE firms. These goals must have a 5 year sunset / additional disparity study per <u>Croson</u> .(DS)		
3.k	City should work to be a “business friendly” city—promoting quality infrastructure and an excellent educational system, rather than placing WMBE hire requirements on contractors		

#	Concept	My rating of this concept (1-5)	Don't know (insert a 1 here)
3.l	Require utilization of WMBE's as a condition of award for public works projects – or private projects where contractors are receiving public benefits or grants.		
3.m	Do not impose any WMBE mandates on public works bidders		
3.n	Require prompt payment of WMBE subcontractors		
3.o	Provide contractors with incentives to offset WMBE costs		
3.p	Do not create incentives for WMBE firms to remain small—larger firms will have more capacity to hire the target populations the City seeks to support		
3.q	Fund skills training for Tacoma residents		
3.r	Subsidize prime contractors costs for up to a capped number of WMBEs		
3.s	Promote/fund small firm mentorship programs		
3.t	Partner with private and nonprofit firms to create a one-stop assistance shop for WMBEs		
3.u	Expand outreach to help contractors connect with qualified WMBEs		
3.v	Provide assistance for bonding for small WMBEs		
	(Note: Sample issue 4 is about <u>core worker limits in CWAs</u> , so ideas/concerns on this issue will be addressed in the CWA discussion, rather than this ballot which is focused on solutions in addition to/in lieu of CWAs		
	Sample issue 5: Lack of Supportive Services for WMBEs		
	Most ideas expressed under this item are included under item 3 above , specifically: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Supporting mentorship programs for WMBEs (3.s) • Fund support services for WMBEs (3.c) • Any private project receiving public benefit should be subject to WMBE hiring requirements.(3.i) 		
5.a	Work with education system to promote construction jobs as a career path		
	Sample 6: Prior contractor performance in SBE hiring is not considered in awarding City Contracts		

#	Concept	My rating of this concept (1-5)	Don't know (insert a 1 here)
6.a	Change city processes to track this prime contractor performance data, set performance expectations, and use it in bid process to evaluate bidders—track who bidders said they would hire, and who they actually hired.		
6.b	Drop the SBE requirement entirely to avoid this administrative program		
6.c	Before proceeding with more regulation in this area, complete further data collection on the amount and extent of problem		
6.d	Help contractors by providing list / database of registered SBEs (and WMBEs)		
6.e	Expand outreach to help contractors connect with qualified WMBEs		
6.f	Require utilization of SBE's as a condition of award for public works projects – or private projects where contractors are receiving public benefits or grants.		
6.g	Create oversight committee to track progress on SBE hiring		
6.h	Apply federal standards/guidelines in this areas to city projects		
6.i	Create a formal city evaluation process that allows Primes to help evaluate performance of SBE's in a way that informs the City about whether to keep them on the list.		
	Sample 7: City has no goals specifically targeting small WMBE firms		
7.a	Establish mandatory goals for small WMBE hiring		
7.b	Do outreach, provide support services to help small WMBEs		
7.c	Create set asides or exemptions on projects for these firms on certain scopes of work or projects.		
7.d	Promote a strong education system and business friendly environment		
7.e	Have different qualifications/goals for WMBEs set based on the size of a public works project (tiers)		
7.f	Require WMBE's that are used to meet contractor goals to be state certified.		
7.g	Other agencies are in a better place to provide supportive services to small WMBEs than is the City—don't expand into this area.		
7.h	Set WMBE goals and link them to meaningful rewards or for contractors		
7.i	Award small business contracts in a rotation within the same NAIC		

#	Concept	My rating of this concept (1-5)	Don't know (insert a 1 here)
	NEW: Example 8: Disadvantaged Resident Hiring Goals not being met		
8.a	Amend code to require bidders to submit a plan to show how they will meet goals for hiring of disadvantaged residents (and WMBEs) and make a plan meeting specific requirements a condition of being a responsive bidder (a "point system")		
8.b	Create a City funded program that subsidizes wages and on-the job training costs for disadvantage resident apprentice hires --- money would be given to contractors to offset their additional costs (subject to confirmation of hiring)		
8.c	Increase SBE goals from 15% of hours to 25% of hours		
	Other		
9.a	Participate in regional coordination of workforce development		
9..b	Create a communication platform for WMBEs and SBEs to find jobs, training opportunities		

Legal dept. screened out concepts that are probably illegal (these won't appear on final ballot).