#### Members

Chris Granfield, Chair
Katie Chase, Vice-Chair
Duke York
Jonah Jensen
Lysa Schloesser
James Steel
Jeff Williams
Eugene Thorne
Laureen Skrivan
Lauren Flemister

Ross Bulfington, Wedge Neighborhood Ex-Officio Marshall McClintock, North Slope Ex-Officio

#### Staff

Reuben McKnight, Historic Preservation Officer Lauren Hoogkamer, Historic Preservation Coordinator

# MINUTES

# Landmarks Preservation Commission Planning and Development Services Department

Date:

December 9, 2015

Location: 747 Market Street, Tacoma Municipal Building, Room 248

Commission Members in Attendance:

Chris Granfield, Chair Katie Chase, Vice-Chair

Ratie Chase, Vice-Ci Duke York Eugene Thorne Laureen Skrivan Jonah Jensen Lysa Schloesser James Steel Jeff Williams Lauren Flemister Ross Buffington Marshall McClintock Staff Present: Reuben McKnight John Griffith

Others Present:
Deputy Mayor David Boe
Michael Sullivan
Brittani Flowers

Chair Chris Granfield called the meeting to order at 5:33 p.m.

#### 1. ROLL CALL

## 2. CONSENT AGENDA

- A. Excusal of Absences
- B. Approval of Minutes: 11/18/15

The minutes of 11/18/15 were reviewed and approved as submitted.

#### 3. DESIGN REVIEW

A. 616 St Helens Ave (Wagner Motors)

Exterior alterations

Mr. Reuben McKnight read the staff report.

#### **BACKGROUND**

The Wagner Motors Building is an individually designated City Landmark. Designed by Silas Nelsen and constructed in 1928 for an automobile dealership, it is a concrete structure with a detailed terra cotta façade facing Saint Helens Avenue. A small rear elevation with a roll up garage door and small entry door faces the diagonally running Baker Street to the west.

The application includes the following scope of work:

- 1. East elevation (St. Helens)
  - Clean and repair existing terra cotta
  - Removal of a steel security gate from the main entrance and replacement of the existing door with a new swing
    out door (door grid design will be based on original architectural drawings), with the installation of an iron
    ornamental fence to accommodate the door swing.



- For the car entry, restoration of the thermae window to the original transom alignment and the installation of a new three part folding entry door based on the design of the original car door
- 2. West elevation (Baker Street)
  - Installation of a new exit door sized to meet code requirements, in a design similar to the car door, with a new three light transom window above; swing out doors will require the installation of bollards on either side of the driveway.
  - Replacement of the metal roll up door with a glass roll up door
  - Externally lit 3X8' sign within the existing sign recess panel over the garage door, illuminated by gooseneck lighting anchored behind the parapet
- South elevation (side wall)
  - Installation of a new exit door and stair.

#### **ACTION REQUESTED**

Approval of the above scope of work.

#### **STANDARDS**

- 6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.
- 9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
- 10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

#### **ANALYSIS**

- 1. This property is an individually listed City Landmark, and, as such, is subject to review by the Landmarks Preservation Commission pursuant to TMC 13.05.047 for exterior modifications.
- 2. The removal of the security gate, replacement of the main entry door, and replacement of the nonhistoric display window at the garage entry on Saint Helens appear to be consistent with the character of the building and conform with the original plans included in the application, thus meeting Standards 6 and 9.
- 3. Baker Street is a secondary elevation. Replacing the garage door and widening/replacing the entry door will not remove character defining features, thus meeting Standard 9.
- 4. The proposed sign on the Baker Street elevation will be contained within the designed sign area and will not obscure architectural features. Anchoring into concrete is reversible.
- 5. The exit stair is on a side elevation and will not disrupt or interfere with character defining features, and will allow for the occupancy of the second floor. The installation could be removed at a future date without harming the integrity of the property, thus meeting Standard 10.

#### RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval of the application.

Mr. David Boe, Boe Architects, discussed the history of the building, noting that they had the original plans. Mr. Boe reviewed that the building was originally constructed as a car showroom with a car door on the St. Helens side. The transom above to car door was likely raised when to accommodate delivery trucks when the Arctic Bottling Company later occupied the same space. Historic photos of the building from 1945 and 1958 were discussed. Reviewing the plans, Mr. Boe noted that the building was designed for a single tenant with large spaces and they were trying to make changes that would allow for multiple tenants. He reported that they were proposing restoring the window above the car door, rebuilding the car door entry with a 3-fold door, rebuilding the main entry with a new door that opens out, adding a railing to protect pedestrians from the operation of the door, and fixing the alignment of the transom above the car door. The original mahogany wood would be repainted historic colors.

The Baker Street elevation was discussed. For the entry to what had originally been a service bay, they were proposing a new exit door to meet code requirements and an operable glass garage door. Proposed signage would fit into an existing

recess in the concrete and would be lit from the exterior. Bollards would be installed to protect the opening to the right of way.

The south elevation was discussed. Mr. Boe reviewed a proposal to install an exit stair on the elevation, adding that it would be easier to install on the north elevation, but they did not want to damage the existing mural. The stairs would be a simple metal stair and there would be a light above the door.

Commissioner Thorne asked if the door on the St. Helens elevation would obstruct pedestrian movement on the sidewalk. Mr. Boe responded that there was 14 feet of sidewalk space and most of it would remain unobstructed.

Mr. Marshall McClintock asked about the condition of the terra cotta. Mr. Boe responded that it was in good condition, with only a few cracked pieces.

There was a motion.

"I recommend that the application for 616 St Helens be approved under Standards 6, 9, and 10."

Motion: York Second: Jensen

The motion was approved.

B. 901-913 Broadway (Pantages Theatre)

Exterior alterations

Mr. Reuben McKnight read the staff report.

#### **BACKGROUND**

Built between 1916 and 1918, the Pantages Theatre/Jones Building is an individually listed landmark on the Tacoma Register of Historic Places. The applicant is proposing restoration work including brick cleaning and selective in-kind repointing. The deeply raked joints would be replaced with flush concave joints, which would reduce water infiltration. Concrete on the east wall would be repaired as needed. The stucco on the east and west walls would be cleaned and repaired, as needed. The terra cotta would also be cleaned, repaired, and sealed. Non-historic exterior downspouts would be removed and replaced with internal downspouts on the lower level of the north façade. The wood windows and doors would be repaired and repainted. Any replacement hardware would match the original materials. The glass would be replaced with a ¼" laminated glass with a clear exterior sheet and a low-e coating on the interior sheet or an insulated glass unit with low-e coating. The Pantages sign, installed in the 1980s, would be repainted. The sheet metal cap along the parapet would be repaired in-kind. The rooftop mechanical equipment would also be repainted and the exterior downspouts and splash blocks would be painted and replaced, if needed. The doors, louvers, and fire escape on the east façade would also be repainted. The lighting would be replaced with LED fixture; the existing light poles would be reused.

#### **ACTION REQUESTED**

Approval of the above scope of work.

#### **STANDARDS**

### Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Rehabilitation of Historic Buildings

- The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
- 5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.
- 6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.
- 7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.

#### **ANALYSIS**

- 1. This property is an individual landmark on the Tacoma Register of Historic Places and, as such, is subject to review by the Landmarks Preservation Commission pursuant to TMC 13.05.047 for exterior modifications.
- 2. The historic character of the property is being preserved. No historic material is being removed.
- 3. The exterior finishes are being repaired and restored.
- 4. No historic material is being replaced or destroyed. The window glass is the only new material proposed. Historic windows and doors are being restored. Any new hardware will match the historic material.
- 5. The gentlest means possible will be used to clean and repair the brick, concrete, and terra cotta. Cleaning and restoration methods will adhere to Preservation Briefs 1, 7, 9, 15, and 22.

#### RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval of the application.

The applicant commented that the project was mostly for exterior repair including the terra cotta and the wood sash windows. He provided samples of the two glass types being proposed for the windows to improve sound attenuation and solar gain. He added that the request was for approval of both glass options. Commissioner York asked if there would be any improvement on the energy rating of the windows. The applicant responded that there would not be any improvement on the wood as they were only replacing the glass. The applicant reviewed photos showing the existing conditions on the east façade stucco and discussed plans for repair. Contemporary light standards would keep the same poles, but upgrade to more energy efficient lights. The fire escape, louvres, and doors would be painted. Commissioner Steel asked if the building originally had exterior downspouts. It was noted that originally there had been a canopy on the building and the drains had been internal on the front balcony and drained to the canopy. The plan was to either internalize the drains or replace in kind.

Vice-Chair Chase recused herself.

Mr. Ross Buffington asked if it would be possible to salvage the glass from the windows. It was noted that the glass was not original though the exact date it was replaced was unknown.

There was a motion.

"I move that we approve the application for 901-913 Broadway, Pantages Theatre, as submitted."

Motion: Jensen Second: York

The motion as approved.

#### 4. PRESERVATION PLANNING/BOARD BUSINESS

A. North Slope Inventory Findings

Mr. Reuben McKnight read the staff report.

#### **BACKGROUND**

Tacoma Municipal Code 13.07 requires the Landmarks Commission to adopt and maintain an inventory of historically "contributing" and "noncontributing" properties to guide the design review process. "Contributing" properties are those that contribute to the district's historical associations or architectural qualities. The Commission may review and amend these inventories once on an annual basis, concurrent with amendments to the Commission Bylaws.

On October 14, 2015, the Commission voted to consider changing the following properties from "noncontributing" to "contributing:"

- 1220 N J Street (built 1951)
- 1118 N 12<sup>th</sup> Street (built 1948)

Staff is also recommending adding 301 N L Street (built 1894) to the district inventory as a "contributing" property, since it was previously excluded due to a clerical error.

1220 N J Street is listed as "historic contributing" in the Nomination for the North Slope National Register Historic District. 1118 N 12<sup>th</sup> is listed as "historic noncontributing" in the same nomination.

On November 18, 2015, 1118 N 12<sup>th</sup> Street was removed from further consideration (the intended property was 1320 N 8<sup>th</sup> (built 1951)). Because the hearing notification did not include 1320 N 8<sup>th</sup>, staff further recommends reconsidering this property during the annual update in 2016.

At its Public Hearing on November 18, the Commission received one letter in support of the proposed changes and no other public comment.

#### **EFFECTS**

Exterior alterations to contributing properties require the approval of the Commission prior to the issuance of building permits.

#### RECOMMENDATION

Adoption of the proposed changes.

Mr. McKnight noted that two letters of support from the North Slope Historic District Association and from the neighbors of 1220 North J street had been received.

There was a motion.

"I move the we approve the proposed changes to the North Slope Inventory including 1220 North J Street and 301 North L Street."

Motion: Chase Second: York

The motion was approved.

B. Events and Activities Updates

Mr. Reuben McKnight provided an update on the following events and activities:

#### 2016 Save the Dates

- 1. Heritage Funding Program Workshop, January 2016 TBD
- 2. Heritage League Mixer (12:30pm @ Elemental Pizza, February 6<sup>th</sup>)
- 3. CLG Commissioner Workshop (9:30am-4pm @ Tacoma Convention Center, March 15th, 2016)
- 4. Wood Windows Workshop (1pm-4pm @ Earthwise Tacoma, April 9<sup>th</sup>, 2016)
- 5. Historic Preservation Month, May 2016
  - a) Historic Homes Tour with Tacoma Historical Society (April 30th -May 1st)
  - b) Proclamation (5pm @ City Council, May 3rd, 2016)
  - c) Kick-Off with Historic Tacoma (May 6, 2016)
  - d) Amazing Preservation Race (11am @ UWT, May 14th, 2016)
  - e) Midcentury Modern Ride—Formerly Known as the Tweed Ride (10:30am, May 21st, 2016)
  - f) Poetry Slam
  - g) Awards Ceremony (1pm-3pm @ The Swiss, May 22<sup>nd</sup>, 2016)
- 6. Neighborhood History Walks with the Councilmembers, June 2016 TBD

Commissioner Williams requested individual web pages for the different events, to make it easier to promote events like the Wood Windows Workshop.

C. Staff Comments

Mr. Reuben McKnight announced that it would be the last meeting for Commissioner Laureen Skrivan and Wedge Neighborhood Ex-Officio Ross Buffington. Mr. McKnight thanked them for their time and effort.

The proposed Narrowmoor Conservation District was discussed. Mr. McKnight reported that the Narrowmoor Conservation District had failed to pass a vote at the City Council due to a number of the concerns including the ability to develop additional structures within the proposed district; the legacy of the covenants; housing and social equity; and the impact of the design guidelines. He commented that there would likely be a larger conversation on how Conservation Districts fit into the Conservation continuum. Discussion ensued. Deputy Mayor David Boe commented that the issue came down to the Covenants in place. He discussed having explored possible changes to the proposal in a meeting with representatives of the Master Builder's Association and the Narrowmoor neighborhood, but he felt that they couldn't get it to the point where the City Council vote would have been significantly different. Deputy Mayor Boe commented that he

#### LPC Minutes 12/09/2015, Page 6 of 6

had recommended to the City Manager that when an application for a Conservation District comes forward there be a sunset of neighborhood covenants when the district is established.

Deputy Mayor David Boe thanked the Commissioners for their work.

Mr. Michael Sullivan commented that they would not be where they are now without the work of Deputy Mayor David Boe to advance preservation. He commented that there is a profound philosophical question on the issue of increased density. He noted that the primary tool for preservation is citizen based design review, while the primary tool for planning is zoning administered by City staff. He commented that with the charter change that raised the status of the Landmarks Preservation Commission, they had the opportunity to be advocates for citizen based design review. He commented that a message they would need to get across is that they are not against greater density, but are against the use of zoning as a blunt tool for it. He added that neighbors would never accept it unless they participate in the process from the beginning.

Discussion ensued on the issues between neighborhood covenants and the Conservation district. Mr. McKnight commented that the proposal itself had been compatible with the covenants, but there was complexity from City policies.

Brittani Flowers, Downtown: On the Go! Business Outreach Coordinator, invited Commissioners to their Friday forum at the University of Washington Tacoma.

#### 5. CHAIR COMMENTS

Chair Chris Granfield thanked Commissioners Skrivan and Buffington for their years of service and volunteer work with the City.

The meeting was adjourned at 6:34 p.m.

Submitted as True and Correct:

Reuben McKnight

**Historic Preservation Officer**