

Members

Ken House, *Chair*
Edward Echte, *Vice Chair*
Katie Chase
Jonah Jensen
Megan Luce
Daniel Rahe
James Steel
Duke York

Ross Buffington, *Wedge Neighborhood Ex-Officio*
Marshall McClintock, *North Slope Ex-Officio*

Staff

Reuben McKnight, *Historic Preservation Officer*
Tonie Cook, *Landmarks Coordinator*



MINUTES

Landmarks Preservation Commission Planning and Development Services Department

Date: January 9, 2013

LPC 39 /13

Location: 747 Market Street, Tacoma Municipal Building, Room 248

Commission Members in Attendance:

Ken House *Chair*
Edward Echte, *Vice Chair*
Ross Buffington
Katie Chase
Jonah Jensen
Marshall McClintock
Daniel Rahe
James Steel
Duke York

Staff Present:

Reuben McKnight
Tonie Cook

Others Present:

Michael Everett

Commission Members Absent:

Commissioner Megan Luce

Commissioner Ken House called the meeting to order at 5:32 p.m.

Commissioners welcomed new Commissioner James Steel.

There was a motion:

"I move that we, the Landmarks Preservation Commission, accept by acclamation the nomination of Commissioner Ken House as Chair and Commissioner Ed Echte as Vice Chair, of the Landmarks Preservation Commission"

MOTION: York
SECOND: Chase
MOTION: Carried

1. CONSENT AGENDA

A. Excusal of Absences

Commissioner Megan Luce was excused.

B. Meeting Minutes

The meeting minutes of December 12, 2012 were approved.

C. Administrative Approvals

The Administrative Review Summary listing approved projects, accepted from December 6, 2012 through January 3, 2013.

2. DESIGN REVIEW

A. 1010 North 11th (North Slope Historic Special Review District)

Ms. Tonie Cook read the staff report which follows:

Built in 1890, this Queen Anne style home, located at 1010 North 11th Street, is a contributing structure in the North Slope Historic Special Review District. As part of the North Slope, it is listed on the Tacoma, Washington State and National Registers of Historic Places. The current project is a retroactive application to remove and replace wood cladding on three elevations, including wood window trim, and rotten porch posts, porch facing and lattice. The wood corner boards on the front and side of the house were added to match what may have been original or added to the rear.

The belly band (i.e. dark color in photo) appears to be original to the house and is retained. The lower half of the house siding now matches the upper level new shingles; previously, the shingles were larger, possibly 8-inch size.

The purpose of the project began as a repair but due to miscommunication by the construction worker and more deterioration than first planned for, the three elevations became involved.

Previous photos from 1977 and 1996 show that the house has been altered; an enclosed porch was changed to an open porch area in 1996. No cornerboards are visible (or they are difficult to see) in these early photos. In addition, the house exterior will be painted when the weather improves.

1. Project includes repair and replacement of siding on three elevations, including:
 - a. Replacement of siding to match inkind the upper siding on the front, side and rear elevations;
 - b. Replacement of lower level siding to match the upper siding; the existing siding appeared to be 8-inch shingles that may have been installed in the 1950s or 1960s;
 - c. Repair and replacement of the porch wood posts to match inkind the existing posts and front deck facing (i.e. not the deck) and repair/replacement, including the addition of front corner boards to what appears to match the rear (cornerboards).
2. This project is visible to the public right of way, however, it started as a shingle repair and changed to more replacement than originally planned for, due to deterioration.
3. There have been previous alterations including changing the front enclosed porch to a non-enclosed porch by the 1990s.

This project was not proposed by Staff for administrative review because of certain visual changes, the primary being the reconfiguration of the nonhistoric shingles on the lower story.

Standards to be considered as follows.

Design Guidelines for the Wedge Neighborhood and North Slope Historic Special Review Districts

Section III, Guidelines for the alteration of Existing Buildings.

HISTORIC SIDING AND EXTERIORS

Traditional materials in the used for exterior cladding in the district include horizontal wood siding (including various types and dimensions of drop siding and bevel siding), wood shingles and shakes, and, to a lesser extent, brick, stucco and half timbering, and stone.

Guidelines for Exterior Siding and Materials

1. **Avoid removal of large amounts of original siding.**
2. **Repair small areas of failure before replacing all siding.** It is rarely advisable to replace all of the existing siding on a home, both for conservation reasons and for cost reasons. Where there are areas of siding failure, it is most appropriate to spot repair as needed with small amounts of matching material. Where extensive damage, including rot or other failure, has occurred, siding should be replaced with as close a material and **visual match** as is feasible, including matching reveals, widths, configuration, patterns and detailing.
4. **Avoid changing the appearance, pattern or configuration of original siding.** The siding type, configuration, reveal, and shingle pattern all are important elements of a home's historic character.

Analysis to be considered as follows:

1. The home on the property is historically significant as a contributing structure in the North Slope Historic District; it was constructed in 1989. As part of the North Slope it is listed on the Tacoma, Washington and National Registers of Historic Places.
2. The Landmarks Preservation Commission has jurisdiction to review and approve, or not approve, changes to this building including new construction per TMC 13.07.095, prior to those changes being made, by virtue of its status as a City Landmark.
3. During repair of original historic siding, the removal and replacement of all of the existing wood shingles should be avoided and, in this case, does not appear to meet the Design Guidelines for the Wedge and North Slope Historic Special Review Districts, specifically, Section III, #1, "*Avoid removal of large amounts of original siding*"; however, the reported extensive deterioration may have necessitated the extensive removal.
4. The new siding on the upper level does match the original siding, thus meeting Guidelines for Exterior Siding and Materials, #4, "*Avoid changing the appearance, pattern or configuration of original siding. The siding type, configuration, reveal, and shingle pattern all are important elements of a home's historic character*"
5. The lower level siding appears to have been 8-inch wood shingles which does not match the newly installed siding; the new siding matches the new upper level siding. Guidelines for Exterior Siding and Materials, specifically Guideline #4, specifically states, "*Avoid changing the appearance, pattern or configuration of original siding. The siding type, configuration, reveal, and shingle pattern all are important elements of a home's historic character.* The 8-inch siding may have been installed in the 1950s or 1960s; there is no evidence of the original siding from photos.
6. The new addition of wood corner boards on the front and side of the house were installed for the purpose of matching the rear corner boards, which may have been a previous installation, but may not be original or appropriate to the Queen Anne style house. Removal of the corner boards may be a consideration by the Commission.

Staff recommended adoption of the above analysis as findings and recommended approval of the retroactive application by the Commission pending consideration of the corner boards.

Mr. Michael Everett, property owner, provided background on the process of the proposal without obtaining permits, which was due to his work schedule and the contractor's miscommunication.

Commissioner Marshall McClintock, North Slope Ex-Officio, asked about the trim under the window sills, (i.e. the sill skirt) and commented on the 8-inch shingles and corner boards which were most likely not original to the house.

Commissioner Duke York commented on the difficulty in the removal of corner boards.

Mr. Everett commented that it was possible to remove the corner boards.

Commissioner James Steel noted the appropriateness of continuous boards without a break around the perimeter of the house.

There was clarification on the comment of the type of inspector, which was a labor inspector on the site.

There was discussion on the possible gap underneath the window and to install molding over the gap which would be painted. It was noted that there was no sill skirt on the rear windows and the power main runs through the rear alley cornerboard. It was agreed the rear corner boards were not original and this modification was most likely completed by a previous owner.

There was a motion:

"I move that we, the Landmarks Preservation Commission, approve the application that includes the removal of the vertical corner board on the front left northwest elevation; shingle siding will be woven together in this front elevation area; in addition, the cornerboard will be removed from the front perimeter of the house; the flat skirt sill trim board at the windows will be painted to match the field color on the house"

MOTION: York
SECOND: Jensen
MOTION: Carried

There was clarification that the work consists only on the front elevation.

3. BOARD BUSINESS/PRESERVATION PLANNING

A. Live Work/Loft

There was discussion that a letter of support be written and submitted on creating Live Work Loft uses in the city.

There was a motion:

"I move that we, the Landmarks Preservation Commission, write a letter of support of the City's ongoing efforts to adopt regulations and codes to develop "live-work" uses in underutilized buildings, including historic properties"

MOTION: Raye
SECOND: Jensen
MOTION: Carried

B. Historic Preservation Month

Mr. Reuben McKnight described the annual historic preservation month in May.

The meeting was adjourned at 6:00 p.m.

Submitted as True and Correct:

Reuben McKnight, Historic Preservation Officer