

Members

Ken House, *Chair*
Edward Echtle, *Vice Chair*
Katie Chase
JD Elquist
Jonah Jensen
Megan Luce
Daniel Rahe
James Steel
Duke York

Ross Buffington, *Wedge Neighborhood Ex-Officio*
Marshall McClintock, *North Slope Ex-Officio*

Staff

Reuben McKnight, *Historic Preservation Officer*
Tonie Cook, *Landmarks Coordinator*



MINUTES

Landmarks Preservation Commission Planning and Development Services Department

Date: April 10, 2013

LPC 36 /13

Location: 747 Market Street, Tacoma Municipal Building, City Council

Commission Members in Attendance:

Ken House, *Chair*
Ross Buffington
Katie Chase
JD Elquist
Jonah Jensen
Marshall McClintock
Daniel Rahe
James Steel
Duke York

Staff Present:

Reuben McKnight
Tonie Cook

Others Present:

Grant Carr, Mia Palosi, Olivia Swenson, Julie Turner, Sharon Winters, Jori Adkins, Brett Santhuff, Steve Larson, Dan Stoehr, Donna Price, Kevin Grossman, Karen Hazen, Denise Hanni, Ryan Hinkson, William Cammarano, Sue Keene, Aimee Collins, The Johnsons, Collin Gibson, Bernard Bates, Carole Stow, Elizabeth Witecki, Connie Brown, Aubrey Askins, Ron Harpel, Michael Kennedy, William Johnson

Commission Members Absent:

Commissioners Edward Echtle and Megan Luce

Chair Ken House called the meeting to order at 5:35 p.m.

1. CONSENT AGENDA

A. Excusal of Absences

Commissioners Edward Echtle and Megan Luce were excused.

B. Meeting Minutes

The meeting minutes of February 13, and 27, 2013 were approved.

2. PUBLIC HEARING

Chair Ken House presented the instructions and agenda items for the public hearing.

Mr. Reuben McKnight provided information on the general order and summarized the public hearing agenda items, including the proposed Name Change of the 800 Block of North 13th to Mr. Dahl Drive; Nominations to the Tacoma Register of Historic Places, which includes the Cobblestone and Brick Streets (700-1000 Blocks of N 9th, 10th and 11th Streets) and Kellogg-Sicker and H.C. Pochert Buildings (1110-12 and 1114-16 Martin Luther King Jr Way); and the Landmark Boundary Change request to 1239 E 54th St (J.M. Hendrickson Homestead).

Chair Ken House invited the proponents to present their proposal

Mr. Grant Carr

Good evening, my name is Grant Carr, I am a part of Ms. Keene's fifth grade class and we want to re-name the

street after our principal Mr Dahl. The first time I met him was at 7 o'clock at my preschool at night. He came to talk about Lowell and answer parents questions about why Lowell was such a great school and after working early to do traffic patrol for our school.

Then in fourth grade before he died, he talked about, to my father, he talked about middle school and going to Jason Lee and which I will be attending. He actually went to Jason Lee and grew up in Tacoma, which is part of why he was such a great principal, how he knew so much about Tacoma and about its history, because of him growing up there throughout his life.

And, I think my favorite thing about Mr. Dahl was he always had the right things to say...Like, when you were sad or mad, he always had a way to calm me down and then just make you feel happy again. And always sneak a joke in to make you laugh and feel better.

That's why we think Mr Dahl deserves this honor and why he was such a great man and that's why we're doing this for him.

Chair Ken House thanked Mr. Carr for speaking and stated his appreciation for his presentation.

Ms. Alexis Swenson

I am Alexis Swenson from Lowell Elementary School and I fully support changing the name of North 13th St to Mr Dahl Drive for many reasons. First, Lowell is the only address effected by it so, it isn't inconvenient to any houses or businesses. Second, there is the only street named Mr. Dahl Drive. because our class researched it. Third, the land that we want to change the street on was given to Tacoma Public Schools 50 years ago. The Tacoma Public Schools supports this change. We wrote a letter to them and they responded a few months later with the answer, yes. If you are worried about the money, don't worry because the PTA has it covered and supports it also.

Mr Dahl was whatever you could ask for principal at Lowell. Every day he walked kids across the street with the best smile. Mr. Dahl was principal at Lowell for 15 years without fail. His always had time for people in need. Every month we'd have a food drive to help people who couldn't afford it. As awards we'd have crazy hat day or twin day.

I've know him most of my life and made me smile.

Everyday I wear a brace for him and only take it off for soccer games when I'm forced to but sometimes I sneak it. I live across the street from school and watch him help kids cross the street with his big smile. He knew everyone's name and loved to talk to students. At Lowell there is what is known as honor student when teachers write something nice about students. That was all his idea. I will never forget his kindness and memories he made with us.

I really hope you consider changing North 13th Street to Mr. Dahl Drive in his memory.

Chair Ken House thanked the students for the letters and the maps.

Ms. Mia Palosi

Hi, my name is Mia Palosi and I'm a 5th grader at Lowell Elementary. I have known Mr Dahl for a very long time because I have been at Lowell since Kindergarten. And my sister, who is now 15 yrs old also attended Lowell. Mr Dahl was such a generous person and dedicated his life to the students and staff.

He knew every student's name and to make sure they feel welcome even if they were new students. He always had a smile on his face and made every year at Lowell fun. On special occasions he wore crazy times according on the occasion. He encouraged us and certain amount of points for reading and if we reached our goals he'd go up on the roof in school and recess. Also he cared about our community. Every month, we collected food to send to the food bank. Also, he encouraged us to recycle for our environment. My class researched and found there is no other street named Mr. Dahl Drive. Please consider this change to Mr. Dahl Drive. It will make a difference for each of us who knew and loved him. Thank you.

Ms. Olivia Swenson

Hello everyone. My name is Olivia Swenson. I live at 1231 North Yakima Avenue. I'm here to talk about Mr. Dahl and the memories I've had with him. I've known him for nearly all my life. With my first year with him at

Lowell at Kindergarten I could tell he was filled with his kindness. Mr. Dahl knew every child's name and made everyone feel special in their own way.

One thing I will always remember is honor students, everyone student at Lowell is an honor student. I live across the street from Lowell and every morning and afternoon he would be out on the crosswalk with his flag walking students across the street with a smile on his face. I miss that alot. Mr. Dahl also worked so hard on making Lowell a better school everyday. Some nights I would see him at work very latel. There's not a day that goes by that I don't miss Mr. Dahl. Mr. Dahl was the first person who I really cared about who passed away. I could go on and on about how great Mr. Dahl was as a principal and person so I really hope take changing North 13th Street to Mr. Dahl Drive into consideration because I know all Lowell students will really love you for this. Also there is no other house associated with North 13th Street. Mr.Dahl has changed so many lives and he has changed mine forever. Thank you.

Cobblestone & Brick Historic Pavements:

Applicant, Mr. Marshall McClintock stated that there is not more to add to the nomination at this time.

He continued, explaining the nomination does not change the boundaries of the North Slope Hisotric District; it applies to the streets only and not the property. He further explained there was no concern in the past, when the streets were under protection by Landmarks; then, in 2005, the streets were under the authority of Public Works. In 2008, the City Council addressed the recognition of historic street as landmarks, therefore, this application for nomination for these streets is requested.

Ms. Julie Turner

Good evening Commissioners, my name is Julie Turner. I live at 817 North J Street, which is two houses away from North 9th, the brick street that we have left. I've been worried about this street for a number of years and it pleases me to see that we have an opportunity to put it on the register and perhaps have the repair to them that would keep them the way they are. Well, more or less, afterall we cannot make them new again. But some of these things that are remnants of Tacoma's past, it is important to keep a sample of them around.

We have samples of houses in the North Slope and, in fact, all over town but, these are pretty much the last samples of this type of street. So I urge you to pass the nomination and send it on, so that we can try to find some options for keeping these streets workable. Thank you.

Mr. William Cammarano

My name is William Cammarano. I've lived at 902 N G st with my family for 45 years. Prior to that time, I lived at 2516 North Carr Street and I attended the original Lowell School 1945 to 48. Luckily, I wasn't there when the sad event happened during the earthquake. But anyhow, I could ride a bike up and down North 11th, North...I couldn't ride it up because I wasn't strong enough. But, I could ride it down North 11th, North 10th at that time, but today, it would be suicide.

Anyhow getting back to...I am opposed to any piece of infrastructure being put on that historic register and that goes back to the three bridges problem we had about 30 years ago, the Yakima Avenue bridge, the 21st Street bridge and the Proctor Street bridge. The city announced they were going to close the Yakima Avenue bridge and it came out that it was on a historic register. And they were having to close it because they could not get financing from the state or the fed to repair it because it would have to be brought up to code.

But somehow about 10 years, 15 years later, when 21st Street was failing and Proctor was failing, they found a way to completely rebuild those bridges. So I could guess it is how important the bridge is before you get to...get it fixed. I live and have watched Ninth Street deteriorate for the 45 years I've been there, between G and Yakima. I still use it, it's still the best of the three.

10th st, I would call a car breaker in its present condition. I don't think the people in the Buckingham Apartment relish trying to get in and out of their garage because the street's so bad. And I noticed you left 11th between G and Yakima Avenue out because it had been paved over. Now that's deteriorating.

The curbing on the east side of 9th Street, between G and Yakima is 75% gone, there is a large dip that covers half of the street laterally, about 30 feet below the intersection at Yakima. Nothing has been done to that since

I've moved there. It was patched prior to the time I've moved there and it has sunk since then. I have brought people's attention to it who were repairing pavement other places and it has never been touched.

So I think any thoroughfare that is used 24-7-365 should have first of all, maintenance and not have another level of bureaucracy to have to go through to get the project done. If you people can get the project, get the streets the way they should be and then make them historic maybe that's a good idea, but don't tie'm up in a historic preservation rule before they're fixed. Thank you.

Kellogg-Sicker H.C. Pochert Buildings Nomination

Commissioner Ross Buffington, Wedge Historic District Ex Officio: *Mr. Chairman, in the interest of public disclosure, I would like to mention that I recently attended the meeting of the city's Economic Development Committee and spoke in favor of adding these two buildings to the register. I also would like to point out that as an Ex-officio member of this Commission, I do not get to vote on this or any other matters.*

Mr. Kevin Grossman

Hi, my name is Kevin Grossman, my address in Tacoma is 821 Yakima. I own a couple of buildings in the Hilltop. I want to address the designation of the...I am not sure if it is or Pochert...the Kellogg-Sicker, Pochert buildings. I am President of the Hilltop Business Association and the general feeling is that the preservation of these buildings as a good character representation in the neighborhood is really important so, we are in support of the nomination going through. For the facade preservation of these buildings, that character is...makes a real strong statement for the neighborhood and bringing that back on line will be a good demonstration of the viability of the MLK corridor and is consistent with both the ULI study done recently and the sub area planning exercises around historic preservation and historic character.

There have been some conversations, I got involved and interested in this building about a year ago when I heard rumors that there were some plans on tearing these buildings down to basically provide a larger development site for a housing project. And in doing some digging the foundation on which those decisions were being, well not decisions, plans were being made...were really resting on a study that was done, not with the purpose or intent of trying to rehab the building.

I am a private developer and I own old buildings, actually my building at 821 Yakima is a 1929 structural brick apartment building so I am familiar with the issues related to old buildings. I actually initiated a tour of the building with the city, we had THA, we had probably six or seven architects, we had two different contractors, two different structural engineers, and two contractors. And I can tell you, that building can be preserved and rehab'd and brought back on line in an economically viable fashion. So I just wanted to share that. Thank you.

Ms. Sharon Winters

Hi, I am Sharon Winters with Historic Tacoma. Historic Tacoma nominated the buildings to the register, actually the nomination was co-sponsored with the new Tacoma neighborhood council. And has the support of the MLK sub area steering committee.

The Kellogg-Sicker and Pochert buildings are in the heart of what was once a thriving commercial district and we believe they are character defining structures, critical to the future development of the MLK subarea. We believe that the register listing is really important not only to preserve the buildings but, in order to provide better access to financial incentives that will make the rehab more feasible.

We really believe that the rehab of these buildings are gonna be a catalyst project for the MLK corridor. And as Ross mentioned, Ross was at a recent meeting of the Economic Development Council of City Council on behalf of Historic Tacoma. And the public works department staff presented plans for the sale of the city's tier one properties, which include these two buildings. They certainly meet tier one criteria for being strategically located with high visibility, they're creating a high level of interest as indicated by the subarea planning group and the Central Neighborhood Council and New Tacoma Council. And they're instrumental in meeting the city's economic development goals.

Staff noted opportunities at the site, which include there being a catalytic site, which we very much believe, a major node on MLK and, pedestrian oriented and mixed use center.

The Urban Land Institute has recommended a mixed use residential, 80% market rate and 20% low income in a recent study they did up on the Hilltop.

Historic Tacoma urges the Commission and City Council to support this nomination and we've also asked to be involved in discussion on redevelopment at the site including development of a RFP for the sale of the buildings, which is expected in the next three to six months. Thanks.

Ms. Jori Adkins

My name is Jori Adkins and I'm at 301 Puyallup Avenue in the Dome District. My husband and I also develop buildings similar to these two buildings and feel very strongly that these two buildings should be saved. And I think that through this nomination that can happen. And I think that's really important, they're important to the MLK area.

There aren't a lot of buildings up there. And also this type of building, this is not, it's not one of the schools or the city halls or you know, hotels or something like that. This is just a commercial building and I think that those buildings for neighborhoods like this in commercial areas that are trying to struggle to make themselves something, need to be saved and I think that's really important.

And we're in the same situation in the Dome District with our buildings and when we look up to MLK and see the same thing up there needs to happen and these type of buildings are the ones that will help give it some grounding and things like that so I hope you will look toward nomination. Thank you.

Brett Santhuff

"Thank you, I am Brett Santhuff at 720 6th Avenue, and I'm pleased to see the nominations going forward on the Kellogg Sicker H.M. Pochert buildings. I'm an intern architect and expressing my interest in this nomination as a community member, a Tacoma Hilltop resident, and also as a longtime member organizer with Historic Tacoma.

We need to recognize the opportunity these buildings represent for the future of the neighborhood. To honor the sense of place and the past as we move forward developing a diverse and vibrant MLK mixed use center. These buildings are located at the center of the neighborhood, and the nomination is significant to positioning these buildings for rehabilitation and investment. As evidenced in the photos and the narrative of the nomination, these buildings possess a great amount of detail particularly at the street elevation.

They were designed by a noted architect and we are fortunate to have original drawings to aid in the future reconstruction of the storefronts. I urge you to support this nomination, champion the future rehabilitation of these structures, and to recommend to city council listing these buildings onto the Tacoma Historic Register.

[There were no comments on the landmark boundary modification.]

Chair Ken House summarized the comment period deadlines for the two nominations, landmark boundary change and street name change.

3. DESIGN REVIEW

1. 3701 North 26th Street – Washington Elementary

Commissioner Jonah Jensen was recused from this agenda item.

Commissioner Ross noted his recent meetings with the BLRB Architects to assist in developing a timeline in the Washington Elementary school yard. He noted his non-voting status on the Commission as Wedge Historic District Ex Officio.

Mr. Reuben McKnight noted the presenter on this agenda item is Ron Harpel. Mr. Reuben McKnight read the Staff Report into the record as follows:

Built in 1906, and subsequently expanded in 1910 and 1949, Washington Elementary remains the oldest operating elementary school in Tacoma. In 2006 it was listed on the Tacoma, Washington and National Registers of Historic Places. The designation includes the original structure, as well as the 1910 and 1949. The playgrounds and parking lots are excluded.

On January 23, 2013, the Commission approved modifications to the historic building including relocation of the entrance, seismic and foundation improvements, construction of two attached additions (one of which will replace a 1949 addition), and site improvements.

The Commission's approval was conditioned on the future submittal of additional details for the new main entrance, building signage (including directional and wayfinding, as well as inspirational lettering on additions) and the roof plan, material and color, including HVAC/mechanical elements and screening.

In response to the Commission's decision, the applicant has provided the following additional information:

- 1) Main Entrance – The main entrance is proposed to be constructed of cast stone to be similar to the existing stone base at the 1906 building. The bottom of the entablature above will be determined by the height of the stone band between the first and second floor. Inscribed on the west side of the entablature facing Adams is the name of the school in 12" letters. The north side of the entablature has the construction date of 1906 for the original building. The south side has the date of 2014 to signify the date of completion for the additions and the main entrance. Facing the two westernmost columns are sconce fixtures. There will be wood windows at the north and south elevations as well as a wood door and frame at the west side. A 15" high bench built of concrete and bricks salvaged from the 1949 building will be integrated into the main entrance as a way to tie it into the site and building.
- 2) Building Signage – In the ROW along the west side of the site, we are proposing a bench that radiates from the center of the plaza and provides a border between the plaza and the street. Facing that bench will be 12" cast aluminum letters spelling Washington Elementary School as a way to indicate the main entrance to the building. A monumental sign is being proposed at the south side of the site, fronting North 26th which is the core pedestrian street. This is currently in development and drawings will be provided at the Landmarks meeting. At the public entrance to the lunchroom, we are paying homage to the first principal and teacher of Washington, Carrie Shaw Rice. Along with being an educator, she was a nominee for superintendent and a writer, and poet. One of her poems named "September" was penned in the early 20th century and spoke to the return to school for the students then after the summer vacation. It will be a multi-media signage that starts from the exterior above. The first stanzas are read from above and they get smaller as they float down to the eye level of the viewer. Subsequent stanzas are read from the interior and become part of the wall below and end in an inscription upon a bench built of salvaged wood from the 1949 building. The letters on the glass will be vinyl graphics. 12" cast aluminum letters spelling "Washington Kindergarten" will be placed above the kindergarten entrance on North 27th Street. The entablatures above the library window and the gymnasium operable door will be reduced from 24" high to 16" high so that they do not compete with the main entrance but still maintain a scale appropriate to the proportions of those facades. Drawings will be provided at the meeting for those signs.
- 3) Roof – The roof of the historic building will be replaced with asphalt shingles. The roofs at the additions have been changed from a PVC roof to a modified bituminous which allow us to match the color and granules of the roof at the historic building. We will bring the proposed colors to the meeting. The only mechanical units are

on the north side of the building, above the kitchen. The design team has consolidated these in one location. The enclosure is in the development right now and drawings will be provided to the Commission on April 10th.

4) Brick Color – The color will be very similar to the color of the existing masonry at the 1906 building. Samples will be brought to the meeting.

5) Changes – Updated elevations and site plan. There have been some minor adjustments to windows at the additions and the sectional door facing the garden area has been enlarged. The planters and garden area have been modified and the transformer has been relocated to adhere to TPU standards. These will be provided as an update during our landmarks meeting.

ACTION REQUESTED Approval of the submittals and additional details, as meeting the conditions set forth in the January 23 Commission decision.

Mr. Ron Harpel, BLRB, presented the update including slide presentation to the Commission on the above items. He described and showed representations of modifications including screening material, roof color complimentary to the roof material, re-use of the bricks, raised aluminum letters, ambient light to show the letters, incorporation of a monument sign on 26th, an address on Adam Street, main entry feature clarification on premium precast or cast stone material, historic light fixtures on the columns, 1906 and 2014 years listed onto the entrance area, poem letters installed onto the glass with vinyl letters; North masonry, screening and providing enclosures around mechanical units, precast signage at the gym and library, illustration on east elevation using aluminum frame and laminated glass, lower elevation of Washington Street-reveal lines on concrete, and final construction details and cross sections.

Commissioner James Steel asked about the screen element around mechanical units (laminated or glazing system) and the belly band around kitchen (3.1 plan sheet) area, which is precast.

Chair Ken House asked for clarification on the durability of the vinyl letters of the poem. Mr. Ron Harpel offered that new improvements in this technology have been made for better endurance.

Commissioner Duke York asked about the goals for the photovoltaic system. Mr Ron Harpel discussed the goal as being more educational at this time.

There is a motion:

“I move that we, the Landmarks Preservation Commission, approve the submittals on additional details for Washington Elementary”

MOTION: Chase
SECOND: York
MOTION: Carried

2. 705 North J St (North Slope)

Mr. Reuben McKnight read the Staff Report into the record.

The home at 705 N J Street, built in 1904, is a contributing structure in the North Slope Historic District. This is a proposal to extend an existing nonhistoric deck (constructed in 2000) at the rear of the house with an 8X8' addition, and to remove the existing railing that consists of lattice and posts, and replace it with a more historically appropriate railing, including rails, 2x2" balusters and a traditional railing cap, all in clear cedar.

Action Requested: Approval of a deck extension and new railing to an existing deck.

Standards to be considered: Design Guidelines for the Wedge Neighborhood and North Slope Historic Districts

Section III: Guidelines for the Alteration of Existing Buildings

Guidelines for Porches

3. Replace missing porches with designs and details that reflect the original design, if known. Avoid adding conjectural elements. Photographic or other documentary evidence should guide the design of replacement porches. Where this is unavailable, a new design should be based on existing original porches from houses of similar type and age.

Guidelines for Additions

3. Additions should be sensitively located in a manner that minimizes visibility from primary rights of way. Where this is not possible, the design should respect the style, scale, massing, rhythm, and materials or the original building.

Analysis to be considered.

1. This house is historically significant as a contributing structure in the North Slope Historic District; it was built in 1904. As part of the North Slope it is listed on the Tacoma, Washington and National Registers of Historic Places.

2. The Landmarks Preservation Commission has jurisdiction to review and approve, or not approve, changes to this building per TMC 13.05.047, prior to those changes being made, by virtue of its status as a City Landmark.

3. The existing deck is a nonhistoric deck built in 2000.

4. The proposed cedar railing, with a cap and baluster system, appears to be compatible with the overall style and material of traditional railing systems, thus meeting Guidelines for Porches #3.

5. The location of the addition to the deck does not appear to be highly visible, thus meeting Guidelines for Additions #3.

Staff recommended adoption of the above analysis as findings and approval of the application as submitted.

Property owner Mr. Johnson described the proposed changes.

Commissioner Marshall McClintock North Slope Ex Officio noted that he does not vote in his role on the Commission. He commented that the proposed repair to a nonhistoric deck was not visible to the streets and urged approval to the Commission.

There was a motion:

"I move that we, the Landmarks Preservation Commission, approve the proposal as submitted, for property at 705 North J Street"

MOTION: York
SECOND: Jensen
MOTION: Carried

3. 1401 North 5th Street (North Slope)

Mr. Reuben McKnight read the staff report into the meeting record as follows. Built in 1895, the original house at 1401 N 5th Street was extensively altered for medical institutional use, along with a similar house at 1415 N 5th

Street, beginning in the 1940s. The property is a contributing structure located in the North Slope Historic Special Review District.

On October 26, 2011 and December 14, 2011, the Commission approved the proposal by a new property owner, to make specific exterior improvements including windows, siding, and the front door and porch design.

The current proposal includes the installation of a new concrete driveway 19 feet in width, using the materials and specifications cited in HD-NS02 for new driveway entrance construction and HD-NS03 for sidewalk construction.

The proposed new driveway construction requires review by the Commission based on the Wedge and North Slope Historic Special Review District Guidelines for Parking.

In addition, the land use services will be reviewed for exact placement of the driveway and parking area prior to the Commission meeting on April 10, 2013.

Action Requested: Approval of the proposed new curb cut and sidewalk for access from Sheridan.

**Standards to be considered: Wedge and North Slope Historic Special Review District Guidelines
Section III: Garages and Parking**

1. **Alley accessed parking is the typical and predominant residential parking configuration in the district.** Residential driveways and garages facing the street are typically only appropriate when there is no alley access, or other site constraints prevent alley accessed parking (such as a corner lot).

4 **New curb cuts are discouraged.** Residential driveways requiring curb cuts from a street or arterial are generally prohibited, unless the applicant can demonstrate by clear and convincing evidence that because of special circumstances not applicable to other property or facilities, including size, shape, design, topography, location, or surroundings, the strict application of this standard prevents alley accessed parking. If approved, such curb cuts and approaches shall be consistent with the standards approved for the historic districts and on file in the Public Works Department.

Analysis to be considered.

1. This house is historically significant as a contributing structure in the North Slope Historic District; it was built

in 1895. As part of the North Slope it is listed on the Tacoma, Washington and National Registers of Historic Places.

2. The Landmarks Preservation Commission has jurisdiction to review and approve, or not approve, changes to this building per TMC 13.05.047, prior to those changes being made, by virtue of its status as a City Landmark.

3. The property is located on a corner lot and the proposed new driveway is on Sheridan; the main entrance to the home is on 5th Street. On the alley side of the property is the location of a new home approved by the Commission in 2012; this home has an alley accessed garage/parking area, which does not allow access to the 1501 North 5th home or rear yard space. The proposed new curb cut and driveway on this corner lot, meets North Slope Historic Special Review District Guidelines for Parking, Section III, Garages and Parking, #1, specifically, for, "*Residential driveways and garages facing the street are typically only appropriate when there is no alley access, or other site constraints prevent alley accessed parking (such as a corner lot)*"

4. The proposed new concrete driveway will be constructed consistent with construction standards, HD-NS02 (driveway) and which meets the North Slope Historic Special Review District Guidelines for Parking, Section III, Garages and Parking, specifically, "*...If approved, such curb cuts and approaches shall be consistent with the standards approved for the historic district and on file in the Public Works Department...*".

5. The new curb cut is proposed because there is no alley access nor is there any other area for access to off street parking. The guidance for parking is North Slope Historic Special Review District Guideline # 9, which specifically states, "...Proposed residential driveway approaches requiring curb cuts off a street or arterial are generally prohibited, unless the applicant can demonstrate by clear and convincing evidence that, because of special circumstances not generally applicable to other property or facilities, including size, shape, design, topography, location, or surroundings, the strict application of this standard prevents alley accessed parking", which the proposed location appears to meet the guideline as the only suitable site.

6. The proposed sidewalk meets North Slope Historic District construction standard.

Staff recommended approval of the analysis as findings and approval of the proposal to the Commission.

Property owner Ms. Aubrey Askins noted there was no other available location for the driveway, showed the access on Sheridan and noted hiring a licensed contractor for construction.

Commissioner Marshall McClintock North Slope Ex Officio stated the proposal was an appropriate curbcut application and described the background and changes to this lot during the past few years. He complimented the owners on the rehabilitation on the house.

Commissioner Duke York stated his support of the owners' recent work on the home and the proposed new driveway design.

There was a motion:

"I move that we, the Landmarks Preservation Commission, approve the proposed new driveway design and location, for property at 1401 North 5th Street"

MOTION: Jensen

SECOND: York

MOTION: Carried

Chair Ken stated the approval will be issued by staff.

4. 811 North M Street (North Slope)

Mr. Reuben McKnight read the staff report into the meeting record.

Built in 1890, the Queen Anne style house is a contributing structure located in the North Slope Historic Special Review District. The house was previously altered by covering the front façade with wide horizontal siding and attaching it flush to the window trim; the rear porch has been enclosed; the windows all appear to be original with the possible exception of the enclosed rear porch and kitchen window on the west elevation. Enclosed are photos of the elevations including windows, and the design sheets.

The proposal includes:

1. Replacement of most of the windows with Andersen Woodwright Series 400 wood clad windows (with the exception of two front bay windows which will be restored)
2. Replacement of deteriorated siding on the front façade and in other areas as needed with cedar lap siding.
3. Construction of a rear second story addition
4. Construction of a new detached garage 17X22' garage on the rear of the property, sided in cedar lap siding.

5. Retroactive approval for the removal of an existing garage. According to the applicant, the existing garage was in poor condition. Aerial and birds-eye photos do not provide a clear image of the previous garage; it appears to have been at least partially obscured by overgrown vegetation.

The applicant states that many of the existing windows are inoperable and deteriorated. Some of the windows (i.e. front) have new non original horizontal siding covering a portion of the window trim as shown in the photos, and there is one cracked window.

Action Requested: Approval of the proposed window replacement, second story addition, retroactive removal of garage, and construction of a new garage.

Standards to be considered: **Wedge and North Slope Historic Special Review Districts Design Guidelines Section III Alteration of Existing Buildings**

Windows

1. **Preserve Existing Historic Windows.** Existing historic windows in good working order should be maintained on historic homes in the district. The existing wood windows exhibit craftsmanship and carpentry methods in use at the time that the neighborhood was developed. New manufactured windows, even those made of wood, generally do not exhibit these characteristics.
2. **Repair Original Windows Where Possible.** Original wood windows that are in disrepair should be repaired if feasible. The feasibility of different approaches depends on the conditions, estimated cost, and total project scope. Examples of substandard conditions that do not necessarily warrant replacement include: failed glazing compound, broken glass panes, windows painted shut, deteriorated paint surface (interior or exterior) and loose joinery. These conditions alone do not justify window replacement. Repair of loose or cracked glazing, loose joinery or stuck sashes may be suitable for a carpenter or handyperson. Significant rot, deterioration, or reconstruction of failed joints may require the services of a window restoration company. If information is needed regarding vendors that provide these services, please contact the Historic Preservation Office.
3. **Replace windows with a close visual and material match.** When repairing original windows is not feasible, replacement may be considered.
 - Where replacement is desired, the new windows should match the old windows in design and other details, and, where possible, materials.
 - Certain window products, such as composite clad windows, closely replicate original appearance and therefore may be appropriate. This should be demonstrated to the Commission with material samples and product specification sheets.
 - Changing the configuration, style or pattern of original windows is not encouraged, generally (for example, adding a highly styled divided light window where none existed before, or adding an architecturally incompatible pattern, such as a Prairie style gridded window to a English Cottage house).

Guidelines for Exterior Siding and Materials

1. **Avoid removal of large amounts of original siding.**
2. **Repair small areas of failure before replacing all siding.** It is rarely advisable to replace all of the existing siding on a home, both for conservation reasons and for cost reasons. Where there are areas of siding failure, it is most appropriate to spot repair as needed with small amounts of matching material. Where extensive damage, including rot or other failure, has occurred, siding should be replaced with as close a material and **visual match** as is feasible, including matching reveals,

Guidelines for Additions

1. **Architectural style should be compatible** with the era and style of the principal structure, including massing, window patterning, scale of individual elements, cladding, roof form, and exterior materials.

2. **Additions should be sensitively located** in a manner that minimizes visibility from primary rights of way. Where this is not possible, the design should respect the style, scale, massing, rhythm, and materials or the original building.
3. **An addition should be subservient** in size, scale and location to the principal structure.

Guidelines for Parking and Garages

1. **Minimize views of parking and garages from the public right-of-way.** Parking areas and garages should be set toward the rear of the lot to minimize visibility from primary rights of way. Parking lots and banks of garage doors along the front facade of a building do not conform to the character of the neighborhood. Where it is not possible to locate a parking structure to conceal it from view, it should be set well back from the front plane of the primary structure on the property. Off-street parking lots have no historic precedent in the residential areas of the neighborhoods and should be located behind the building and away from the street.

Analysis to be considered:

1. The home on the property is a contributing structure in the North Slope Historic Special Review District.
2. The Landmarks Preservation Commission has jurisdiction to review and approve, or not approve, new construction at this property per TMC 13.05.047, prior to those changes being made, by virtue of its location within the North Slope Historic Special Review District.
3. The removal of existing original windows does not meet North Slope Special Review District Guideline Section #3 Windows, #2, unless it can be demonstrated that the rehabilitation of the existing windows is not feasible due to condition or economic considerations. The current windows show wear and some have new siding attached flush with the window trim, as well as one window with broken glass and some evidence of rot. However, the repair of the front bay windows is consistent with this guideline.
4. The proposed replacement windows, Anderson Woodwright Series 400 wood clad windows do appear to meet North Slope Special Review District Guideline Section #3 Windows, #3, which notes, "*Certain window products, such as composite clad windows, closely replicate original appearance and therefore may be appropriate.*"
5. Removal of nonoriginal siding and installing cedar lapsiding on the front façade and other areas as needed, meets Guidelines for Exterior Siding and materials, #1 and #2, for "*Avoid removal of large amounts of original siding.* and "*Repair small areas of failure before replacing all siding. It is rarely advisable to replace all of the existing siding on a home, both for conservation reasons and for cost reasons*"
6. The addition on the rear second story that is centered on the rear with minimal visibility, and steps down to the original structure appears to meet the North Slope Guidelines for Additions, specifically for, "*Additions should be sensitively located in a manner that minimizes visibility from primary rights of way. Where this is not possible, the design should respect the style, scale, massing, rhythm, and materials or the original building*" and, "*An addition should be subservient in size, scale and location to the principal structure.*"
7. The owner removed the failing and nonfunctional garage without knowing the process of review for demolition of buildings in the North Slope Historic District. There is little information available regarding this structure. The Commission has approved several garage removals and replacements in the past for various reasons (poor condition, too small, etc).
8. The new garage is proposed on the rear elevation of the property as a detached structure, which will be visible from the alley, which meets the *North Slope Historic District Guideline #2, for Garages and Parking*, specifically for, "*Minimize views of parking and garages from the public right-of-way...Setting garages and carport structures back from the front of the building reduces their visual importance*".

Staff recommended adopting the above as findings and recommended approval by the Commission.

Mr. Michael Kennedy and Mr. Ryan Hinkson, RH Design and Construction, talked about the very deteriorated, unsafe condition of the garage that was removed.

Commissioner Marshall McClintock North Slope Ex Officio complimented the contractors on this challenging Property and, highlighted his concern with the proposal to remove and replace all of the windows, noting that some of the windows are not original, but most of the others which are original do not appear in poor condition.

There was clarification that all proposed new windows shown in the new design sheets will be single hung, specifically stating that the addition's window will have framing separating the two windows.

Commissioner Ross Buffington, Wedge Ex Officio, asked for clarification of paragraph #3 in the staff analysis.

Mr. Reuben McKnight stated that #3 suggests that if the windows are found needing replacement, the guidelines are not met but if they are met, that replacements will be compatible new windows; he stated #3 is not suggesting any conclusion of the existing condition of the windows on this property.

Commissioner Ross Buffington stated that the windows shown in the photos do not show sufficient deterioration requiring anything other than repair or rehabilitation.

Commissioner Duke York recommended a site visit by the Commission to review the condition of the windows.

Commissioner James Steel asked for clarification on the existing shingles, noting their intricate unique design that appear to be compatible to the age and style of the house.

Mr. Ryan Hinkson stated these shingles will be retained.

There was discussion on the potential plumbing covering on the side elevation, clarification on existing staircase windows not shown on the new proposed design sheets and clarification on the existing knee braces will be restored.

There was discussion of the windows on each elevation.

There was a motion:

"I move that we, the Landmarks Preservation Commission, approve the rehabilitation on this property, including siding repair, rear addition, retroactive removal of the detached garage, and new garage design; and defer the removal and replacement of all of the existing windows pending site visit review by the Commission, on property at 811 North M Street"

MOTION: York
SECOND: Steel
MOTION: Carried

4. BOARD BUSINESS/PRESERVATION PLANNING

i. Historic Preservation Month

The Commission agreed to schedule time on the agenda at a May City Council Meeting and plan a reception at 4 pm in City hall prior to the city council meeting.

Commissioner Ross Buffington volunteered to donate towards light refreshments at the reception.

The meeting was adjourned at 7:07 p.m.

Submitted as True and Correct

Reuben McKnight
Historic Preservation Officer